

- Table of Contents -

Acknowledgements	p. i
Table of common abbreviations	iii
Introduction	p. 1
Research Design	11
i. Overview	11
ii. Methodology	12
iii. Structure and aim of the study	14
 <u>PART ONE</u>	
Chapter I - Understanding the phenomenon	p. 19
1. Learning from criminology	19
2. A look to the world: global (food) supply chains and exploitation	20
I. Food supply chains: a clarification	21
II. The growth of supermarkets chains as ‘food authorities’	21
III. Extensive subcontracting chains offering fertile conditions for exploitation	22
IV. Paradigmatic cases across the globe	23
i. Child labour in cocoa production in Ghana and Ivory Coast	24
ii. Forced labour in the Thai shrimps industry	25
iii. Refugees’ exploitation in olive cultivation in Turkey	26
3. Labour exploitation in the agri-food sector across Europe	27
I. Evidence about labour exploitation abounds	28
II. Trafficking cases for labour exploitation	30
4. The job market in the Italian agriculture and food production	33
I. Looking for up-to-date numbers	34
II. Relevant actors	36
III. High rate of irregularities	37
i. The (illegal) gangmaster system	37
ii. Landless cooperatives and international employment agencies	39
iii. The expansion of voucher use	40
IV. Agromafia: the nexus between the agro-food sector and mafia-type organisations	41
V. Labour inspections: still few and ineffective	41
5. Italian case studies	44
I. The Rosarno riot: the tip of the iceberg	46
II. The strike of Nardò: an isolated case of migrants’ self-organization	48

III. Romanian women in Sicily: multiple exploitation?	49
IV. Sikh in the Latina area: a community of merely hands	50
V. North of Italy: exploitation also in the 'quality food' product chains	51
6. The media coverage: the rise of 'modern slavery'	53
7. The way of production: capturing trends	54
I. The continuum of exploitation: between decent work and forced labour	55
II. Precariousness, vulnerability and exploitation: peculiarities of the sector?	56
III. A close (but not exclusive) relationship between migration and exploitation	57
8. Who are the victims?	60
9. Snapshot of (notoriously unreliable) data	62

PART TWO

Chapter II - The current legal framework: international and regional levels	p. 69
1. Setting the stage: the current intertwined system of sources of law	69
2. The international context	72
I. The first definition of slavery: a property law paradigm	73
II. The ILO concept of forced labour: a call to action	75
III. Trafficking: a tiny part of the global problem	81
3. Regional levels	89
A. The Council of Europe: a human rights perspective	89
I. Article 4 ECHR as interpreted by the European Court	89
II. CoE Trafficking Convention: balancing human rights and prosecution reasons	93
B. The European Union: an area of freedom, security and justice	102
I. Directive 2011/36/EU: building further on international standards	103
II. Short-term permits to protect trafficking victims: an opportunistic approach?	113
III. Is irregular immigration fostering exploitation? Acting against the employment pull factor	116
IV. A level playing field for (new) seasonal workers	121
V. Towards victims' protection	126
VI. Compensation to crime victims	132
VII. Labour exploitation in a nutshell	133
C. The Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe: soft language, strong efforts	133
4. Agreed legal definitions at the international and regional levels	135
Chapter III - The current legal framework: the case of Italy	p. 141
1. An overview of the domestic legislation	141
2. Sanctions: from undeclared work to the most serious forms of exploitation	143
A. Violations of administrative law	143
I. A maxi-sanction for undeclared work	144

II. Suspension of the business activity	146
B. Criminal offences	148
I. Employment and exploitation of illegally staying third-country nationals	148
i. Prohibition of illegal employment	148
ii. Employment of illegally staying third-country nationals or aiding and abetting of illegal immigration?	150
iii. The aggravating circumstance for exploitation	151
iv. Null contract but valid effects to protect the worker	154
II. The so-called <i>caporalato</i> provision	155
III. Maltreatment of family members or cohabitants	162
IV. Association for purposes of committing crimes under Articles 600, 601 and 602 CC.	162
V. Violence or threats, coercion and unjust profit: is there extortion?	163
VI. Reducing or holding a person in a condition of slavery or servitude: the most serious forms of labour exploitation	165
VII. Trafficking in persons: towards a single definition	171
VIII. Purchase and sale of slaves: a residual provision	177
3. Irregular migration and victims of exploitation	178
I. Irregular migration and the Union	179
II. The Italian case	179
III. Is Article 10 <i>bis</i> a risk factor to exploitation?	182
IV. Law No. 67/2014: what happened to Article 10 <i>bis</i> ?	184
V. A proposed interpretation to respect, protect, and fulfil the human rights of all persons	186
4. Victims' protection	187
I. The Italian model to protect the victims of exploitation	187
A. Article 13, Law No. 228/2003: short-term assistance for victims of slavery and trafficking	187
B. Article 18, Consolidated Immigration Act: long-term assistance for victims of severe exploitation	188
C. The single programme of emergence, assistance and social integration	194
II. The rationale for unconditional protection	194
III. System actions on trafficking	195
IV. Legislative Decree No. 24/2014: fully implementing Directive 2011/36/EU?	196
V. What kind of compensation and for whom?	199
VI. The Italian Action Plan against trafficking	200
5. An effective criminal justice system	201

PART THREE

Chapter IV - In search of a preventive strategy	p. 207
1. Key principles and standards	207

I. An integrated human rights-based approach for all subject involved	209
II. All workers shall be treated equally and without discrimination	210
III. Taking care of victims	212
i. Overcoming a stereotypical perception of victims	213
ii. Links between the protection of victims of trafficking and asylum procedures	214
iii. Widening protection to all victims of exploitation	214
2. Labour exploitation as corporate crime	215
I. What is ‘corporate crime’?	215
II. Corporate liability for ‘labour exploitation’ in Italy	218
3. Building on existing experiences	221
I. Business and Human Rights	221
i. A closer look at the UN Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights	222
a. The State’s (legal) duty to protect	224
b. The corporate responsibility to respect: the concept of due diligence	224
c. Access to effective remedy	225
ii. General international human rights standards for businesses	228
a. ILO Multinational Enterprises Declaration	228
b. OECD Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises	229
c. UN Global Compact	230
d. GRI - G4 Guidelines	231
e. ISO 26000	231
II. ‘Good laws’	232
i. Chain liability to protect workers’ rights in subcontracting: Netherlands (and Italy)	232
ii. The Brazilian ‘dirty list’	233
iii. California Transparency in Supply Chains Act	234
iv. Section 54 of the UK Modern Slavery Act	236
III. Good practices	237
i. Proactive measures	238
ii. Measures promoting cooperation	239
iii. Measures aiming at restorative outcomes in a broad sense	240
IV. Learning from inadequate solutions	241
3. A ‘responsive’ strategy	243
I. Understanding responsive regulation	243
i. The regulatory pyramid	244
ii. Tripartitism	245
iii. A process-approach to compliance	245
II. Towards a principle-based framework	247
III. A regulatory pyramid for fighting labour exploitation in the agri-food sector	247
i. Education and persuasion	250

ii. Mandated self-regulation	254
a. Transparency legislations	254
i. Disclosure requirements	255
ii. Due diligence obligations	258
b. Regulation of market mechanisms	260
iii. Administrative sanctions with ‘corporate probation’	261
iv. Criminal law provisions	263
5. Is there room for restorative justice?	264

Final remarks	p. 269
----------------------	---------------

Annex I

Gli illeciti in materia di sfruttamento lavorativo nell’ordinamento italiano	p. 273
--	--------

REFERENCES

Bibliographical References	332
International legal resources and related documents (reasoned)	399
Regional legal resources and related documents (reasoned)	403
Main national legal resources (Italy)	408
Case law	410
Press	412