

**UNIVERSITÀ CATTOLICA DEL SACRO CUORE  
MILANO**

**DOTTORATO DI RICERCA IN CRIMINOLOGIA**

**Ciclo XXXIII**

**S.S.D.: SPS/12**

**A LIFE-COURSE APPROACH TO CO-OFFENDING IN ORGANIZED CRIME**

**Tesi di Dottorato di: Cecilia Meneghini**

**Matricola: 4714059**

**Supervisore: Prof. Francesco Calderoni**

**Anno Accademico 2019/2020**

International Ph.D. in Criminology - Cycle XXXIII

# A life-course approach to co-offending in organized crime

Ph.D. Thesis

Candidate: Cecilia Meneghini



UNIVERSITÀ  
CATTOLICA  
del Sacro Cuore

InternationalPHDin  
**Criminology**  
transcrime  
Joint Research Centre on Transnational Crime

November 2020

Advisor: Prof. Francesco Calderoni

Academic Year 2019/2020





# Contents

<b>List of Tables</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>List of Figures</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>Abstract</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>1 Background</b>	<b>17</b>
1.1 Researching organized criminal groups . . . . .	17
1.1.1 Defining organized crime . . . . .	17
1.1.2 Traditional perspectives . . . . .	22
1.1.3 Contemporary perspectives . . . . .	24
1.2 Developmental and life-course approaches to the study of organized crime	30
1.2.1 Criminal careers in organized crime . . . . .	33
1.3 Co-offending relationships of organized crime members . . . . .	37
1.3.1 Findings about co-offending . . . . .	38
1.3.2 Co-offending network analysis of organized criminal groups . . . . .	49
1.4 Theoretical perspectives to co-offending in organized crime . . . . .	51
1.4.1 The decision to co-offend . . . . .	52
1.4.2 The impact of co-offending . . . . .	54
1.4.3 Co-offending and organized crime involvement . . . . .	56
<b>2 Motivation</b>	<b>58</b>
2.1 Intersecting three strands of research . . . . .	58
2.2 Aim of this work . . . . .	59
<b>3 Methodology</b>	<b>64</b>
3.1 Data . . . . .	64
3.1.1 Data sources . . . . .	64
3.1.2 Data treatment operations . . . . .	65

## Contents

3.1.3	The PMM data set . . . . .	72
3.2	Methods . . . . .	75
3.2.1	Sample adjustments . . . . .	75
3.2.2	Objective 1: Characteristics of co-offending . . . . .	79
3.2.3	Objective 2: Co-offending trajectories . . . . .	83
3.2.4	Objective 3 and 4: Co-offending, future offending, and recruitment . . . . .	93
<b>4</b>	<b>Results</b>	<b>106</b>
4.1	Characteristics of co-offending in organized crime . . . . .	106
4.1.1	Predictors of co-offending . . . . .	106
4.1.2	Characteristics of co-offenders . . . . .	122
4.2	Co-offending trajectories of organized crime offenders . . . . .	127
4.3	The impact of co-offending on the criminal career of organized crime offenders . . . . .	132
4.3.1	Stationarity and memory of co-offending . . . . .	132
4.3.2	Co-offending and future offending . . . . .	139
4.3.3	Co-offending and violence . . . . .	141
4.4	Co-offending and recruitment into organized crime . . . . .	151
<b>5</b>	<b>Discussion</b>	<b>159</b>
5.1	Research questions and main findings . . . . .	159
5.2	Contribution of this study . . . . .	171
5.2.1	Organized crime research . . . . .	172
5.2.2	Developmental and life-course criminology . . . . .	174
5.2.3	Co-offending research . . . . .	176
5.2.4	Strengths and limitations of the analysis . . . . .	177
<b>6</b>	<b>Conclusions</b>	<b>180</b>
	<b>Appendices</b>	<b>184</b>
	<b>Appendix I: Data cleaning and model specification</b>	<b>185</b>
	<b>Appendix II: Additional results</b>	<b>194</b>
	<b>References</b>	<b>200</b>

# List of Tables

3.1	CRR data set crime categories (N=178,427) . . . . .	66
3.2	CRR data set synthetic crime categories (N=178,427) . . . . .	67
3.3	Descriptive statistics of crimes in the CRR data set (N=178,427) . . . . .	69
3.4	Sociodemographic characteristics of offenders in the PMM data set (N=11,138) . . . . .	73
3.5	Criminal characteristics of offenders in the PMM data set (N=11,138) . . . . .	74
3.6	Trend in the individual-level share of co-offenses . . . . .	78
3.7	Example of sequential representation of data in the STS format . . . . .	96
3.8	Definition of time $t$ state for offender $i$ . . . . .	96
3.9	Frequency of violent states (n= 60,914) . . . . .	98
3.10	Co-offending as a Markov process: tested propositions . . . . .	101
4.1	Co-offending prevalence, by mafia organization (n=142,820) . . . . .	109
4.2	Co-offending prevalence, by role within the mafia group (n=142,820) . . . . .	111
4.3	Co-offending prevalence, by crime category (n=135,781) . . . . .	114
4.4	Mean seriousness of solo and co-offenses, by crime category (n=129,749) . . . . .	116
4.5	Logistic regression for the joint predictors of co-offending (n=129,749) . . . . .	118
4.6	Average Marginal Effects (AMEs) and AMEs at representative values of the predictors of co-offending, random-effects model results (n=129,749) . . . . .	119
4.7	Logistic regression for the joint predictors of co-offending. Extended crime categories (n=129,749) . . . . .	121
4.8	Co-offending and criminal career characteristics . . . . .	124
4.9	Multinomial regression for the characteristics of solo and co-offenders. Baseline category: mixed offenders (n=7,478) . . . . .	126
4.10	Criminal variables distribution by trajectory group (mean values, n=9,332) . . . . .	130
4.11	Distribution of role, by trajectory group (n=4,293) . . . . .	130
4.12	Co-offending and past co-offending . . . . .	134
4.13	Age-stationarity of co-offending process . . . . .	135
4.14	Crime number stationarity of co-offending process . . . . .	136
4.15	Memory of co-offending process, by crime number . . . . .	137

*List of Tables*

4.16	Co-offending and probability of future offending . . . . .	140
4.17	Co-offending, violent co-offending, and probability of future violence. All crimes collapsed in t and t+1, by crime number . . . . .	142
4.18	Co-offending and probability of future violence, by crime number . . . . .	143
4.19	Violent co-offending and probability of future violence, by crime number . . . . .	144
4.20	Dynamic random-effects probit models for the probability of violent co-offending and violent solo offending . . . . .	149
4.21	Dynamic random-effects probit models for the probability of violent co-offending and violent solo offending, additional lags . . . . .	150
4.22	Type of careers preceding the first mafia association offense . . . . .	153
4.23	Type of career transitions preceding the first mafia association offense . . . . .	155
4.24	Co-offending and probability of committing the first mafia offense, by crime number . . . . .	156
4.25	Increased periods of co-offending and probability of committing the first mafia offense, by crime number . . . . .	158
6.1	Correlation matrix of the individual level variables included in the models for the characteristics of co-offenders . . . . .	186
6.2	BIC values for solo offending and co-offending group-based trajectory models	188
6.3	BIC values for solo offending and co-offending group-based multi-trajectory models . . . . .	189
6.4	Parameter estimates for the selected model, solo offending trajectories . . . . .	190
6.5	Parameter estimates for the selected model, co-offending trajectories . . . . .	191
6.6	BIC values for solo offending and co-offending 5-group multi-trajectory models . . . . .	192
6.7	Model accuracy diagnostics for solo offending and co-offending 5-group multi-trajectory models . . . . .	193
6.8	Average Marginal Effects (AMEs) of the crime types in predicting co-offending, random-effects model results (n=129,749) . . . . .	194
6.9	Multinomial regression for the characteristics of solo and co-offenders. Alternative model specification (n=9,819) . . . . .	195
6.10	Unconditional probabilities of criminal states, by age . . . . .	196
6.11	Unconditional probabilities of criminal states, by crime number . . . . .	197
6.12	Co-offending and probability of future violence, by age . . . . .	198
6.13	Violent co-offending and probability of future violence, by age . . . . .	199



# List of Figures

3.1	Trend in the co-offending prevalence (n=160,262) . . . . .	77
4.1	Age-crime curve for solo and co-offenses (n=142,820) . . . . .	107
4.2	Co-offending prevalence and total number of crimes committed by age (n=142,820) . . . . .	108
4.3	Co-offending prevalence, by age and mafia organization (n=142,820) . . .	110
4.4	Co-offending prevalence and total number of crimes committed by crime number (n=142,820) . . . . .	112
4.5	Co-offending prevalence by crime number and total career activity (n=142,820)	113
4.6	Distribution of the individual co-offending prevalence (n=8,923) . . . . .	122
4.7	Distribution of the individual co-offending prevalence, by decade of birth (n=10,024) . . . . .	123
4.8	Solo and co-offending trajectories of organized crime offenders (n=9,332) .	128
4.9	Co-offending prevalence trajectories of organized crime offenders (n=9,332)	129
4.10	Co-offending prevalence, aggregate for trajectories C and D (n=3,922) . .	131
4.11	Unconditional probabilities of solo and co-offending . . . . .	133
4.12	Memory of co-offending process, by crime number . . . . .	138
4.13	Co-offending and probability of future violence. Comparison with baseline probability of violence . . . . .	146
4.14	Co-offending and probability of future violence. Accounting for the num- ber of crimes committed in t and the memory of violence (all crimes col- lapsed in t and t+1) . . . . .	147
4.15	Distribution of states in the sequence of crimes preceding the first mafia association offense . . . . .	152
4.16	Ten most frequent offending sequences preceding the first mafia association offense . . . . .	154
4.17	Co-offending and probability of committing the first mafia offense. All crimes collapsed in t and t+1, by crime number . . . . .	157

*List of Figures*

6.1 Scatterplot of year of sentence and year of crime for mafia association offenses (n=13,958) . . . . . 185

# Abstract

One of the most documented findings on delinquent behavior is that many crimes are committed in the company of others rather than by solo offenders. Besides studying the characteristics of co-offending, recent works have focused on understanding its evolution over the individual criminal career, and its impact on the offending trajectory. Co-offending is especially relevant within organized criminal groups, where interactions among participating offenders constitute the core functioning of the criminal organization, and crimes committed are often logistically complex. In spite of this, few studies on co-offending in organized crime exist, and none of them investigates the role that co-offending has on the offending pathway of the single individual. This study addresses this gap in research by analyzing data on all the 178,427 crimes committed by 11,138 offenders convicted for mafia association in Italy between 1985 and 2017. The data set includes information on whether each crime was committed with accomplices. The analysis exploits different quantitative methodologies with the aim to describe the characteristics of co-offenses and co-offenders in organized crime; determine whether organized crime offenders have different longitudinal co-offending trajectories; investigate whether committing crimes with others impacts future offending; and understand how co-offending is related to recruitment into organized crime.

Results demonstrate that co-offending is not an incidental feature of crimes committed by organized crime offenders. Some of the characteristics of co-offending in organized crime reflect findings from other offending samples, but some peculiarities emerge. Furthermore, the longitudinal co-offending behavior of Italian organized crime offenders is best approximated by five trajectories that group offenders with distinct characteristics. Finally, co-offending is related to changes in the future offending behavior of organized crime offenders: in particular, it is related to higher chances of engaging in violent forms of delinquency and experiencing organized crime recruitment in the short term. These findings are discussed in relation to both research on the developmental course of offending for members of organized criminal groups, and existing knowledge on the causes and consequences of offending with others.